ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING

REPORT TO CSIRO

DECEMBER 2014

CSIRO's IMPACT AND VALUE

AN INDEPENDENT EVALUATION





ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING PTY LTD ABN 68 102 652 148

LEVEL FIFTEEN 127 CREEK STREET BRISBANE QLD 4000 AUSTRALIA T+61 7 3009 8700 F+61 7 3009 8799

LEVEL TWO 33 AINSLIE PLACE CANBERRA ACT 2600 AUSTRALIA T+61 2 6103 8200 F+61 2 6103 8233

LEVEL NINE 60 COLLINS STREET MELBOURNE VIC 3000 AUSTRALIA T+61 3 8650 6000 F+61 3 9654 6363

LEVEL ONE 50 PITT STREET SYDNEY NSW 2000 AUSTRALIA T+61 2 8272 5100 F+61 2 9247 2455

SUITE C2 CENTA BUILDING 118 RAILWAY STREET WEST PERTH WA 6005 AUSTRALIA T+61 8 9449 9600 F+61 8 9322 3955

ACILALLEN.COM.AU

RELIANCE AND DISCLAIMER

THE PROFESSIONAL ANALYSIS AND ADVICE IN THIS REPORT HAS BEEN PREPARED BY ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING FOR THE EXCLUSIVE USE OF THE PARTY OR PARTIES TO WHOM IT IS ADDRESSED (THE ADDRESSEE) AND FOR THE PURPOSES SPECIFIED IN IT. THIS REPORT IS SUPPLIED IN GOOD FAITH AND REFLECTS THE KNOWLEDGE, EXPERTISE AND EXPERIENCE OF THE CONSULTANTS INVOLVED. THE REPORT MUST NOT BE PUBLISHED, QUOTED OR DISSEMINATED TO ANY OTHER PARTY WITHOUT ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING'S PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT. ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING ACCEPTS NO RESPONSIBILITY WHATSOEVER FOR ANY LOSS OCCASIONED BY ANY PERSON ACTING OR REFRAINING FROM ACTION AS A RESULT OF RELIANCE ON THE REPORT, OTHER THAN THE ADDRESSEE. IN CONDUCTING THE ANALYSIS IN THIS REPORT ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING HAS ENDEAVOURED TO USE WHAT IT CONSIDERS IS THE BEST INFORMATION AVAILABLE AT THE DATE OF PUBLICATION, INCLUDING INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE ADDRESSEE. UNLESS STATED OTHERWISE, ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING DOES NOT WARRANT THE ACCURACY OF ANY FORECAST OR PROJECTION IN THE REPORT. ALTHOUGH ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING EXERCISES REASONABLE CARE WHEN MAKING FORECASTS OR PROJECTIONS, FACTORS IN THE PROCESS, SUCH AS FUTURE MARKET BEHAVIOUR, ARE INHERENTLY UNCERTAIN AND CANNOT BE FORECAST OR PROJECTED RELIABLY. ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING SHALL NOT BE LIABLE IN RESPECT OF ANY CLAIM ARISING OUT OF THE FAILURE OF A CLIENT INVESTMENT TO PERFORM TO THE ADVANTAGE OF THE CLIENT OT THE ADVANTAGE OF THE CLIENT TO THE DEGREE SUGGESTED OR ASSUMED IN ANY ADVICE OR FORECAST GIVEN BY ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING.

© ACIL ALLEN CONSULTING 2014

Executive Summary

This report assesses CSIRO's impact and value

There is strong evidence of high impact and value

A highly conservative analysis of six case studies that consume less than 7% of CSIRO's annual operating budget created more than \$1b a year in benefits

With a slightly less conservative approach the case study benefits exceed the whole of CSIRO costs

Broader factors drive the expected value past \$5 billion annually...

...delivering an estimated benefit-cost for Flagship and core activity of 5:1

Other unquantified value components would add significantly to the overall benefit-cost ratio This report has been prepared for the Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO) by ACIL Allen Consulting Pty Ltd (AAC). It provides an independent assessment of the economic, social and environmental impact and value of CSIRO, and compares this to the level of investment it is obtaining from the Australian Government.

Our analysis points to a benefit-cost ratio for CSIRO's activities as a whole that is substantially above 5:1. To arrive at this conclusion, we developed the following 'indicators' of value:

- First, we assessed the impact and quantified the value of six case studies. ACIL Allen has conservatively estimated that they have created more than \$1.029 billion per annum in value, which on its own exceeds CSIRO's total appropriation. These case studies account for less than 7 per cent of CSIRO's annual operating costs, and around 11 per cent of CSIRO's annual appropriation.
 - This indicates a conservative benefit-cost ratio for this group of CSIRO activities of over 12:1 and establishes a conservative lower-bound for the value delivered by CSIRO as a whole.
 - > Box ES1 lists some of the highlights from the case studies.
- 2. However, we recognise that our quantification of case study benefits used highly conservative assumptions, in addition, we were unable to quantify all the benefits of the case studies. When we probe both the nature of the assumptions used and some of the dimensions of value that were not quantified, we conclude that the case studies should be attributed with a substantially higher value than the initial conservative assessment described above.
 - We conclude that a more realistic estimate of the expected benefits from the six case studies would be at least 25 per cent higher, at about \$1,286 million annually. This exceeds CSIRO's total annual operating budget.
- 3. We then examined areas of Flagship and Core Program activity not covered by the case studies. To do so we drew on information from past studies and consider how the case studies were selected and consider some of the long- and short-listed 'candidates' that were <u>not</u> selected as case studies. We conclude that taking into account these factors could add around a further \$4 billion in annual value. Indeed, we argue that the extra value could be significantly higher.
 - This increases our estimate of the annual value delivered by CSIRO to at least \$5 billion.
 - This supports a still rather conservative assessment of the expected benefit-cost ratio for all of CSIRO's activities of around 5:1.
- 4. In addition, we have also recognised, and assessed as highly valuable, a number of other elements of CSIRO's whole portfolio including the value of its 'standing capabilities', i.e. the ability to quickly respond to new (and sometimes urgent) demands for scientific information in response to unexpected threats (or opportunities). We also considered the value delivered by CSIRO's advisory services and educational services.
 - We did not seek to quantify these benefits, but are confident they would add substantially to the overall value of CSIRO. This implies that the expected benefitcost ratio of CSIRO as a whole is well above 5:1.

In developing our assessment of value we have sought to strike a balance between extreme conservatism and arriving at a reasonable but still highly defensible assessment of the magnitude of the benefit-cost ratio that could realistically be expected to emerge if the analysis were able to be extended across the entire CSIRO portfolio.

The report focuses on the current CSIRO strategy period (2011-2015). However, it takes into account the fact that the value and impact of CSIRO's activities across this period have drawn heavily on earlier work and capability established before 2011. Similarly, many of the impacts identified here can be expected to occur beyond 2015. Our benefits calculations are based on the use of CSIRO's indicator discount rate of 5% (after inflation). However, the analysis was also done using a discount rate of 7%, and the results were little affected.

We conclude that the whole of CSIRO portfolio is delivering an expected return that supports an expected benefit-cost ratio of at least 5:1, and arguably substantially more.

Box ES 1 Selected highlights from the case studies

Some of the key findings from ACIL Allen's evaluation of the case studies are listed below:

- The Australian Animal Health Laboratory (AAHL) provides insurance value, in relation to a
 potential outbreak of foot and mouth disease, equal to \$431 million per annum, as well as
 broader disease mitigation and outbreak response mechanisms for diseases that affect
 industries worth over \$14 billion per annum.
- CSIRO's cotton varieties research has delivered net benefits in terms of increased cotton
 productivity of \$149.3 million over the period 2006/7 to 2013/14 and is forecast to deliver
 additional benefits of \$379.5 million over the next decade.
- CSIRO's longwall automation technology has resulted in a 5 per cent increase in the productivity of longwall underground coal mining and is expected to deliver net benefits of \$785.6 million between 2001/2 and 2024/25.
- CSIRO's HVAC energy management system, OptiCOOL, has yielded energy savings of 10-30 per cent in commercial buildings and is expected to deliver net benefits of \$79.7 million between 2014/15 and 2024/25.
- CSIRO's prawn breeding and prawn breed research is expected to deliver net benefits, in terms of increase productivity of prawn production, equal to \$882.8 million over the period 2004/5 to 2023/24.
- CSIRO's integrated water resources assessments have delivered benefits of between \$685
 million and \$1.24 billion, although this represents quantification of only a small portion of
 impacts. Actual benefits are likely to be higher than this estimate.

Further information on each of the case studies can be found in Section 3 and in Appendix B to Appendix H.

Source: ACIL Allen Consulting